

Selecting A Solution: Pugh Matrix

	Design Concept A	Design Concept B	Design Concept C	Design Concept D	Design Concept BC	Design Concept BD
Criteria 1	S	+	S	+	+	+
Criteria 2	S	-	S	+	S	+
Criteria 3	S	S	S	+	S	+
Criteria 4	S	-	+	+	+	+
Criteria 5	S	-	+	+	+	+
Criteria 6	S	-	S	-	S	-
Criteria 7	S	+	S	-	+	+
Criteria 8	S	+	S	-	+	+
Criteria 9	S	-	S	-	S	-
Criteria 10	S	S	-	S	S	S
TOTAL +	0	3	2	5	5	7
TOTAL -	0	5	1	4	0	2
TOTAL SCORE	0	-2	1	1	5	5

The Pugh Matrix - compares “design candidates” to decide which best meets a set of criteria. It can aid optimisation through hybrid candidates.

One of its key advantages over other decision-making tools such as the Decision Matrix is its ability to handle a large number of decision criteria.

Design Concept A is the baseline – other ideas are scored higher (+) or lower (-) than Concept A (or S for Same)

Important criteria identified by the Adeste partners include:

- Relevance to target group
- Relevance to other, wider audiences
- Deliverability – could the organisation afford/manage this in future?
- Learning: is the idea radical enough that we will learn something?
- Trackability: will we be able to monitor the effectiveness of any experiment?

Example Selecting A Solution

Criteria	Existing Offer? <i>No Parking</i>	Design idea 1 <i>Car Park</i>	Idea 2 <i>Valet parking</i>	Idea 3 <i>Park & Ride</i>	Combined ideas <i>Valet + Park & Ride</i>
Accessibility	0	+ (better)	+	+	+
Solves known problem for “Emma’s” transport	0	+	+	S	+
Achievable in budget	0	- (worse)	-	S	+
Achievable: environment	0	-	+	+	+
Learning gained	0	-	+	S	+
	0	- 1	3	2	5